

# We are the Champions

Reflections before and after Teresa Marques'

*De Se* or *De Nobis*

Paul Dekker

ILLC/Dept. of Philosophy  
Universiteit van Amsterdam  
`p.j.e.dekker@uva.nl`

October 2014

# Overview

- Importance of De Nobis.
- Relevance of Analysis.
- Issues and Observations.

# A Linguistic Take on the Issue

- Collective Intentionality. (Gilbert)
  - ▶ The Romans wanted to rule the world.
- Relational Intentionality in the Plural. (Scha, Keenan)
  - ▶ The Greek inspired / educated the Romans.
- Reflexive Intentionality in the Plural. (Marques)
  - ▶ We have been willfully deceiving ourselves.

# Application 1 (Another Paralel)

- “The Dutch are tolerant. (The Dutch believe.)”
  - ▶ The Dutch are tolerant, indeed.
  - ▶ We are tolerant? No! (Said by the Dutchmen.)
  - ▶ I am tolerant? Sure! (Said by every Dutchman.)
  - ▶ The Dutch are tolerant? No. (Distributively read.)
- De Rebus is not De Nobis is not De Se is not De Re.

# A Philosophical Take on the Issue

- Self-Locating Belief. (Lewis)
- Common Sense Externalism. (Burge, Davidson)
- Joint Belief in a Common World (Wittgenstein)

*“Dass die Welt unsere Welt ist, das zeigt sich darin, dass die Grenzen der Sprache (der Sprache, die allein wir verstehen) die Grenzen unserer Welt bedeuten.” (Wittgenstein, TLP, 5.62, amended)*

*“Das hängt damit zusammen, dass kein Teil unserer Erfahrung auch a priori ist. Alles, was wir sehen, könnte auch anders sein. Alles, was wir überhaupt beschreiben können, könnte auch anders sein. Es gibt keine Ordnung der Dinge a priori.” (Wittgenstein, TLP, 5.634)*

## Application 2 (Answering First Doubt)

- We believe we live in a world we inhabit.
- Genuinely De Se,
- Essentially Plural,
- not Accidentally, but Unnegotiablely.

## Application 3 (Another Paralel)

- The Individual as a Corporate Body. (Merleau Ponty)
  - ▶ Your physicist points out:
    - ★ The bend stick you see in the water is really straight.
  - ▶ Your practitioner points out:
    - ★ The pain you feel *here* is actually *there*.
  - ▶ Your psychiatrist points out:
    - ★ *This* goal of yours is actually *that*.
- We can be as mistaken about ourself as we can about ourselves.  
Indeterminacy of the Nobis paralleled by indeterminacy of the Se.

# A Personal Take on the Issue

- Truth is Negotiable.
- Common Knowledge is Indistinguishable from Collective Delusion.
- Both Consist in a Joint Activity of Maintaining Common Belief.





**"Wait! Wait! Listen to me! ... We don't HAVE to be just sheep!"**